Undergraduate Students' Perception of Hybrid Learning: Voices from English Language Education Students in Pandemic Era

Setia Erliza
State University of Malang, Malang, Indonesia
Corresponding Email: setia.erliza.2002218@students.um.ac.id

Puteri Anugrah Septianingsih
State University of Malang, Malang, Indonesia
Email: puteri.anugrah.2002218@students.um.ac.id

Abstract

The policy in learning has been changed by the government since the Covid 19 cases decreased significantly in Indonesia. Therefore, the implementation of learning in this current era, especially in university level, is conducted limitedly in face to face learning mode known as Pembelajaran Tatap Muka (PTM) terbatas and online learning mode, named Pembelajaran Jarak Jauh (PJJ). These mixed modes of learning are acclaimed as hybrid learning. This transition of learning potentially raises various perceptions among the undergraduate students. Hence, this study aims at investigating the undergraduate students' perception of hybrid learning system in the pandemic era. The participants of this study were 45 English department undergraduate students at State University of Malang. They were 38 females students and 7 males students from the 2nd, 6th and 8th semesters. This study was carried out through survey research design. Henceforth, the data of this study was gathered by spreading a closed-ended questionnaire via Google Form. The findings revealed that the undergraduate students showed positive perceptions regarding hybrid learning in pedagogical, social, and technical aspects. Notwithstanding, the negative perceptions were found in the technical aspects relating to students' concentration in deeper learning and students' difficulties in learning English during hybrid learning. Regardless of the positive and negative perceptions, according to the findings, hybrid learning can be categorized as the effective learning approach as well as the learning solution in this current pandemic era.
Keywords: EFL undergraduate university students, hybrid learning, students' perception, survey design

1. INTRODUCTION

Hybrid learning commonly known as blended learning has been applied in recent years due to the emergence of rapid technological developments. In the same way, technological advances are not the only main reason for implementing this approach at this time but also the spread of Covid 19. In March 2020, the Ministry of Education and Culture through Circular Letter Number 4 of 2020 point number 2 regulates the implementation of online or distance learning called as learning from home. On the other hand, nowadays, the policy has been changed by the government since the Covid 19 cases decreased significantly in Indonesia. Therefore, the government, through a Joint Ministerial Decree Number03/KB/2021 regarding guidelines for the implementation of learning during the COVID-19, declared that teaching and learning is conducted limitedly in face to face learning mode known as *Pembelajaran Tatap Muka (PTM) Terbatas* and online learning mode, named *Pembelajaran Jarak Jauh (PJJ)*. These terms of learning modes are acclaimed as hybrid learning. These modes were conducted in primary and secondary level in early 2021. However, they have been started to be implemented at the university level at the end of 2021 as decreed in Circular Letter Number 4 of 2021, labeled as hybrid learning mode.

Hybrid learning includes self-directed activities as well as the combination of conventional classroom learning and computer assisted learning conforming to Shams (2013). There are four types of hybrid learning such as flex, a la Carte, rotation, and enriched virtual which the majority of the hybrid models that are employed in education belong to these types (Christensen et al., 2013). The first is the flex model which refers to courses where the online section becomes the pivotal pile in students' learning. The second is A la Carte which students can select courses to take online with an online instructor of record in order to enhance their existing face-to-face courses. The next is the rotation model which indicates the students' twist between learning modalities and at least one of the modalities needs to be in an online mode. The last is enriched virtual which the students are able to have face to face learning in person with the teacher and the rest is mostly conducted in online mode.

The studies of hybrid learning in English language learning had been conducted previously by some researchers. The first study by Wichadee (2013) about the implementation of hybrid learning for English language students in four different learning styles (active–reflective, sensing–intuitive, visual–verbal, sequential–global) found that hybrid learning was effective in terms of language development as well as students' high level of satisfaction. The second research was by Shams (2013) of hybrid learning and learners' independence in vocabulary learning. The finding of his research was the learners' independence and vocabulary development enhanced after completing hybrid learning course. The third study was done by Vonti & Rahmah (2019) who showed that the use of hybrid / blended learning models results in a considerable rise in student learning outcome scores. The digital literacy questionnaire also yielded a positive result. The digital literacy of the majority of the students was greatly enhanced, ranging from 10% to 20%. As a result, it is possible to conclude that a hybrid-learning approach can both improve students' grammar achievement and their digital literacy. The fourth research was done by Sutisna & Vonti

(2020) who revealed that the students' digital literacy was increased as a result of implementing hybrid learning method. The fifth study was conducted by Yang et al. (2020) proved the hybrid reading course was popular, effective and beneficial in acquainting them with the hybrid model in terms of readiness for graduate students' upcoming studies. The sixth is a study conducted by Hussein Al Noursi (2020) proved that there was a significant difference between the average test scores of students using the blended learning and the average score of students using traditional method. The seventh study was carried out by Nashir & Laili (2021) affirmed that hybrid learning method is effective to be applied since it can increase students' learning outcomes and scores especially in speaking class. Additionally, another finding confirmed that students would rather study through the hybrid method than full online learning or face-to-face learning.

However, knowing students' perceptions in blended learning are necessary because this model is being utilized in many institutions due to the needs of the present covid condition. Perception, as defined by Hawa et al. (2021), is the way on how someone thinks, how they notice things using their senses of sight and hearing, and their inherent capacity to understand or notice things immediately. As a result, understanding others' points of view or opinions on the issues or things in their environment will be valuable. Hereinafter, students' perceptions of hybrid learning in English language learning had also been studied previously. Firstly, a study conducted by al Zumor et al. (2013) proposed EFL students' perception towards blended learning in advantages, limitations, and suggestions for improvement aspects. The findings were: (1) advantages: enhancing learners' English vocabulary and expanding their reading capabilities; (2) limitations and suggestions for improvements: handling technological issues, providing enough training for students, expanding the number of e-labs, and promoting impressive performance both for teachers and students. Secondly, Talis et al. (2018), in their research, showed that students had positive attitude toward blended learning in ELT relating to students' experience, such as their comfort, interest, activeness and responsibility in learning. Thirdly, the study by Ginting (2018) indicated that the majority of students had positive views on the hybrid learning model in aspects of the curriculum, assessment, classroom management, resources, teaching and learning activities, and teachers' feedback. Fourthly, a study carried out by Kartikasari & Rerung (2018) confirmed that most of the students had positive perceptions on blended learning in English listening and speaking class. The majority of students perceived online learning as an alternative to their traditional classroom learning. Fifthly, a research by Simbolon (2021) revealed that students in hybrid learning had positive perception of their learning experience regarding to three aspects, such as their familiarity with the learning tool which can impact on their motivation to participate in learning, their awareness of the benefits they obtained, and their learning engagement was influenced by the use of ICT devices. Another study was by Alfiras et al. (2021) proved that the effectiveness of the hybrid learning model is determined by students' knowledge of online resources available through hybrid classrooms, students' preparedness to integrate hybrid classes, and teachers' efficiency in providing incredible learning experience. The findings also point to the relevance of advanced Learning Management Systems (LMS) and students' emotional connections with their teachers and classmates in strengthening the participants' successful learning experiences. Lastly, a study performed by Lu (2021) claimed that learners had

generally positive attitudes toward the atmosphere of hybrid method, and they noticed that it could help them to develop their critical thinking skills in a variety of areas.

Regrettably, research on students' perception towards hybrid learning which touch on the PST (Pedagogy, Social Interaction and Technology) model of ICT integration developed by Wang (2009) at university level are in rarity. The previous researchers mostly focused on how the students perceived hybrid learning in general without paying attention to those aspects. Nevertheless, Wang (2009) declared that technical design provides a basis for pedagogical and social design, yet pedagogical and social design is regarded as the most essential aspect influencing learning effectiveness. Similarly, an educational system, as emphasized by Kirschner et al. (2004) is an exact combination of pedagogical, social, and technical components. In addition, Wang (2009) as cited in Lu (2021) affirmed that pedagogy, social engagement, and technology are the three fundamental components of the PST paradigm. Pedagogical design implies choosing appropriate content, activities, and how to use resources; social design includes establishing a safe and comfortable environment in which learners can share and communicate; and the technical design offers learners with availability, accessibility and attractability of technical space. Moreover, Lu (2021) had conducted a study on students' perspectives regarding blended learning with the context of PST model in non-English major students. With this in mind, to fill the gap previously stated, this research aims at conducting study on students' perception of hybrid learning in English major university level which concentrates on the PST model.

Based on these issues, the research questions are formulated as follows: (1) What are undergraduate students' perception of hybrid learning system in terms of psychology aspect amidst Covid-19 pandemic?; (2) What are undergraduate students' perception of hybrid learning system in terms of social aspect amidst Covid-19 pandemic?; (3) What are undergraduate students' perception of hybrid learning system in terms of technical aspect amidst Covid-19 pandemic?

3. RESEARCH METHODS

This study included 45 EFL undergraduate students from the English Department at the State University of Malang, consisting of 38 female students and 7 male students from second, sixth and eighth semesters. Additionally, due to the pandemic situation, the data for this study was gathered using survey online research distributed to students who were participating in hybrid learning. The data was gathered by analyzing undergraduate students' perspectives based on their own personal experiences with hybrid learning. The questionnaire was constructed using the perception theory concept which concentrates on the PST (pedagogy, social interaction, and technology) model.

As previously stated, this study concerned on undergraduate students' perception of hybrid learning during the pandemic era related to the PST model. The questions were organized in accordance with those main themes. Survey design was chosen in this study since Fowler (2014) described that survey research is the respondents answer to questions that are intended to describe the respondents' experiences, attitudes, and other qualities. Closed-ended questions were chosen in this study aiming at capturing their preferences, including perception and experiences in hybrid learning (Amin & Sundari, 2020).

Furthermore, because of the simplicity of constructing, spreading, filling out, and calculating the data, this survey was conducted online using Google Forms as the instrument for collecting data through closed-ended questionnaire. It was arranged in the form of Likert scale with four choices, such as 'strongly disagree', 'disagree', 'agree', 'strongly agree'. The statements were related to the criteria of the PST model: pedagogy, social and technology with the total of 28 items (see Table 1). The students' responses were calculated, analyzed, and described based on the topic.

No	Criteria	Description	Items
1	Pedagogical	the selection of appropriate content, activities, and how to use resources	12
2	Social	the construction of safe and comfortable environment where students can share and communicate	5
3	Technical	the availability, accessibility and attractability of technical space	11

4. FINDINGS

Based on the responses of the students to the questionnaire of undergraduate students' perception towards hybrid learning, It's possible to draw a conclusion that most undergraduate students have a positive attitude towards hybrid learning during the pandemic era. The following three main objectives were emphasized as a result of the findings:

1. Undergraduate students perception of hybrid learning in pedagogy aspect
2. Undergraduate students perception of hybrid learning in social aspect
3. Undergraduate students perception of hybrid learning in technical aspect

Table: 1 Undergraduate students perception of hybrid learning in pedagogy aspect

Questions	Mean	Mode	Strongly Agree	Agree	Disagree	Strongly Disagree
1. In Hybrid learning, the lecturers supply handbook for face-to-face learning in each lesson	0.78	A	17.8%	77.8%	4.4%	0.0%
2. In Hybrid learning, the lecturers share extensive information (e.g., resources' links) for online learning	0.80	A	31.1%	60.0%	6.7%	2.2%
3. The resources in hybrid learning are appropriate to the learning objective in each lesson	0.81	A	26.7%	68.9%	4.4%	0.0%
4. The content of the course in each lesson is appropriate in Hybrid learning to reach the learning objective	0.77	A	17.8%	73.3%	8.9%	0.0%

5. The content of the course runs well in Hybrid learning environment	0.69	A	4.4%	68.9%	26.7%	0.0%
6. Expectations of assignments for learning English in Hybrid learning are clearly stated	0.74	A	15.6%	68.9%	11.1%	4.4%
7. In hybrid learning, the tasks given in each lesson are appropriate to reach the learning objective	0.74	A	13.3%	71.1%	13.3%	2.2%
8. The learning objectives are clearly stated in each lesson	0.75	A	8.9%	82.2%	8.9%	0.0%
9. The organization of each lesson in hybrid learning is easy to follow	0.67	A	8.9%	51.1%	37.8%	2.2%
10.The structure of the environment in hybrid learning helps me focus on learning	0.64	A	4.4%	51.1%	42.2%	2.2%
11.Activities in hybrid learning are planned carefully	0.68	A	4.4%	66.7%	24.4%	4.4%
12. The presentation of the course content in hybrid learning is clear	0.69	A	8.9%	62.2%	26.7%	2.2%

The result showed that most of undergraduate students had the same positive perceptions towards hybrid learning during the pandemic era, especially in the context of pedagogy. Most of the students found that the lecturers supplied handbooks for face-to-face learning in each lesson during hybrid learning, with the percentage of agreement 77,8%. Other than that, most of the students positively perceived that the lecturers provided extensive information for online learning such as links for the additional materials to be learned, with the percentage of agreement 60%. Another finding showed 68,9% of students agreed that the resources given in hybrid learning were proper to the learning objective in each lesson. Furthermore, the students positively agreed with the statement that the content of the course in each lesson was compatible in hybrid learning to reach the learning objective, with the percentage of agreement 73,3%. Again, 68,9% of the students agreed that the content of the course ran well in a hybrid learning environment. Apart from that, expectations of assignments for learning English in hybrid learning were clearly stated with the percentage of agreement 68,9% from the students. Similarly, the percentage of agreement 71,1% of the students showed that tasks given in each lesson were suitable to reach the learning objective. Besides, 82,2% of the students were affirmative that the learning objectives were clearly stated in each lesson. Moreover, the finding showed that the organization of each lesson in hybrid learning was easy to follow, with the students' percentage of agreement 51,1%. Equally, the finding showed 51,1% of the students agreed that the structure of the environment in hybrid learning supported them to focus on learning. The next, the students found that activities in hybrid learning were planned carefully, with 66,7% of percentage agreement. Lastly, the students approved that the presentation of the course content in hybrid learning is clear, with the percentage of agreement 62,2%.

Table: 2 Undergraduate students perception of hybrid learning in social aspect

Questions	Mean	Mode	Strongly Agree	Agree	Disagree	Strongly Disagree
1. Hybrid learning can improve communication with the lecturer, not only face-to-face but also online learning mode through online learning platforms	0.74	A	15.6%	64.4%	20.0%	0.0%
2. In hybrid learning, I can ask my teacher about anything I do not understand	0.77	A	13.3%	82.2%	4.4%	0.0%
3. The lecturers timely provide me comments on my work in hybrid learning	0.73	A	11.1%	68.9%	20.0%	0.0%
4. In hybrid learning, my classmates and I frequently review each other's work	0.73	A	13.3%	64.4%	22.2%	0.0%
5. In hybrid learning, I am encouraged by my teacher's and colleagues' positive attitudes	0.79	A	26.7%	64.4%	8.9%	0.0%

Based on the table, it can be concluded that the majority of the students had positive attitude of hybrid learning related to social aspect. The result showed 64,4% of students agreed that hybrid learning helps them to improve communication with the lecturer, not only face-to-face but also online learning mode through online learning platforms. Likewise, another finding showed that 82,2% of the students concured that they were able to ask the teacher about anything they did not understand in hybrid learning. Other than that, another finding showed that the lecturers timely provided the students comments on their work in hybrid learning, with the students' percentage of agreement 68,9%. Besides, 64,4% of the students agreed that they frequently got peer review during hybrid learning. Lastly, the students perceived that they were encouraged by their teacher and colleagues' positive attitudes in hybrid learning, with the percentage of 64,4%.

Table: 3 Undergraduate students perception of hybrid learning in technical aspect

Questions	Mean	Mode	Strongly Agree	Agree	Disagree	Strongly Disagree
1. Learning English in hybrid learning enables me to concentrate on deeper learning	0.61	D	6.7%	33.3%	55.6%	4.4%
2. Learning English in hybrid learning enables me to become self-motivated and responsible towards my learning.	0.71	A	6.7%	71.1%	22.2%	0.0%
3. It is convenient to learn English through hybrid learning	0.63	A	0.0%	53.3%	44.4%	2.2%
4. It is boring to learn English in a Hybrid learning	0.63	D	11.1%	31.1%	55.6%	2.2%
5. It is difficult to learn English in hybrid learning	0.69	A	15.6%	48.9%	31.1%	4.4%
6. With Hybrid learning method, I feel motivated to explore the content related to the	0.71	A	6.7%	68.9%	24.4%	0.0%

materials						
7. I can increase my English learning abilities through hybrid learning, which enables me to learn whenever and wherever	0.73	A	13.3%	66.7%	17.8%	2.2%
8. With Hybrid learning method, I can finish my tasks anywhere and at any time	0.75	A	24.4%	55.6%	15.6%	4.4%
9. Hybrid learning method makes me tend to be more interested in learning English	0.67	A	6.7%	55.6%	35.6%	2.2%
10. Hybrid learning method enables me to manage my time efficiently in learning English	0.70	A	8.9%	64.4%	24.4%	2.2%
11. Learning English with hybrid learning method makes me more active	0.67	A	6.7%	55.6%	35.6%	2.2%

The positive survey result from the table above proved that learning English in hybrid learning enabled students to become self-motivated and responsible towards the English learning with the students' percentage of agreement 71,1%. Moreover, 53,3% of the students agreed learning English through hybrid learning was convenient. Additionally, 55,6% of the students disagreed that learning English in a hybrid learning was boring, while 31,1% of the students agreed and 11,1% strongly agreed with the statement. Next, the percentage of the statement about students' motivation in exploring the content related to the materials in hybrid learning was that 68.9% agreed and 24.4% disagreed. Furthermore, 66,7% of the students agreed that they were able to increase their English learning abilities through hybrid learning, which allowed them to learn whenever and wherever. Another finding was related to the students' flexibility in finishing their tasks anywhere and anytime with the total 80% of agreement from agree and strongly agree percentage. Besides, 55,6% of the students positively perceived related to the statement that the Hybrid learning method made them tend to be more interested in learning English. Equally important finding from the survey was that 64.4% of the students noticed that hybrid learning method enabled me to manage my time efficiently in learning English.The last, the students agreed that learning English with hybrid learning method made me more active, with the percentage of agreement 55,6%.

In contrast, the negative perceptions from the respondents according to the table above were in terms of the concentration on students' deeper learning and difficulties in learning English during hybrid learning. 55.6% of students disagreed that learning English in hybrid learning enabled them to concentrate on deeper learning, while 33.3% of them agreed and 6.7% strongly agreed with that statement. Furthermore, students agreed that it was difficult to learn English in hybrid learning with the total 64.5% of agreement from the percentage of agree and strongly agree. Yet, 31.1% of the students disagreed with that statement.

5. DISCUSSION

The first finding provided the answer to the first research question related to undergraduate students' perception of the hybrid learning system in terms of pedagogy aspect. The result confirmed that students had the same positive opinions toward the method and the way of teaching provided by the lecturer during hybrid learning. In other words, the

lecturer had properly covered the pedagogy aspect, such as teaching plan competency, teaching-learning process competency, and teaching-learning assessment and evaluation competency in order to facilitate the students in learning. Hence, the current finding was in line with some previous studies (Baharun & Porter, 2009; Talis et al., 2018). Baharun & Porter (2009) proved that students perceived hybrid learning had positive impact on learning outcomes in terms of student mastery of topics and student confidence in learning. Talis et al. (2018), similarity in their study, confirmed that students had positive perception towards hybrid learning since it is more efficient and effective which could make them easy and enhanced in understanding the materials. On the contrary, these findings found were rejected by previous findings by Vaksalla et al. (2019) and (Mohamad et al., 2015). Vaksalla et al. (2019) proved that students had negative perception on blended learning as the instructions of the assignments were unclear. Identically, Mohamad et al. (2015) confirmed that students found difficulties in understanding the content in English language learning.

The second finding addressed to the second research question, which concerned on undergraduate students' perceptions of hybrid learning related to social aspect. The result affirmed that the students had the same positive perceptions towards classroom environment formed by the lecturer in the teaching and learning process. Simply put, the lecturer and the students collaboratively created meaningful learning interaction during hybrid learning. The finding was linked to the some previous research. Hediansah & Surjono (2020) highlighted that hybrid learning had a positive impact in creating a positive environment among teachers and peers, shaping the students into autonomous learners to upgrade their skills, and enhancing teachers' performance in learning management. Consistently, the finding by Nashir & Laili (2021) showed that lecturer and students were still able to communicate across time, location, and distance during hybrid learning. Another similar finding was by Napier et al. (2011) who confirmed that students had high interaction with their teacher. However, the contrast finding on student engagement and blended learning confirmed that several students struggled to work on team and built a community feeling with their classmates in blended learning (Holley & Oliver, 2010). Moreover, Vaksalla et al. (2019) affirmed that the students had negative perception towards blended learning since the students frequently spend a significant amount of time on the internet in hybrid learning to complete a job and obtain notes. As a result, they become less socially connected with others around them.

The third finding delivered the answer of the third research question which focused on undergraduate students' perception of the hybrid learning in terms of technical aspect. The result proved that the students had some positive perceptions towards technical space offered by the lecturer during hybrid learning. It can be inferred that the lecturer gave the appropriate availability, accessibility and attractability in the learning process. This finding was confirmed by previous studies (Talis et al., 2018; Kazi & Moghal, 2019; Bakeer, 2018). Talis et al. (2018) revealed that students had positive perception toward blended learning in ELT relating to students' experience, such as their comfort, interest, activeness and responsibility in learning. Similarly, Kazi & Moghal (2019) confirmed that students had positive perception toward blended learning because of the flexible environment, ease of access, shorter commuting time for learners, and cost effectiveness. In addition, Bakeer (2018) in her study about students' attitudes towards implementing blended learning

affirmed that the students had a positive attitude towards blended learning since it promoted students' motivation, language skills, and autonomous learning. In comparison, Hafiza et al. (2022) indicated that the students had negative perception towards blended learning in the behavioral component as the students did not pay attention to the teacher. Consequently, when students have a negative attitude toward language learning, they will be reluctant and pay less attention during the teaching-learning activity (Abidin et al., 2012). Besides, Vaksalla et al. (2019) revealed that the students had negative perception on blended learning due to the slow internet connection. Additionally, Sriwichai (2020) on her study about students' readiness and problems in learning English through blended learning showed that the students lacked motivation to learn English during blended learning because the students had some difficulties in learning inside and outside the classroom.

Nonetheless, the negative perceptions were in terms of students' concentration in deeper learning and difficulties in learning English during hybrid learning. Regarding the result on students' concentration in hybrid learning was supported by Nouby & Alkhazali (2017). In their result of students on deep learning, Nouby & Alkhazali (2017) verified that students did not have enough time to implement deep learning features in their hybrid module learning. Nevertheless, this result was contradicted with the finding of Ghofur (2017) which indicated that hybrid learning gives contribution to the development of students' learning comprehension. Furthermore, the issue on students' difficulties in learning English during hybrid learning was backed up by Kaur (2013), and Mustika Permata & Nanda (2021). Kaur (2013) claimed that technical challenges become the difficulties in hybrid learning since participants' ability to use the technology successfully is needed. Identically, the down servers which cause the difficulties in carrying out the class to support them in achieving the learning outcomes became another issue faced by the students in hybrid learning (Permata & Nanda, 2021). In a different manner, hybrid learning makes the students easy in English language learning X. Yang (2019) and easier in practicing conversation (Nashir & Laili, 2021).

5. CONCLUSION

To sum up, undergraduate students had positive perceptions towards blended learning in the pedagogic, social and technical aspects. However, the negative perceptions were found in the technical aspects relating to students' concentration in deeper learning and students' difficulties in learning English during hybrid learning. Regardless of the positive and negative perceptions, according to the findings, hybrid learning can be categorized as the effective learning approach as well as the learning solution in this current pandemic era.

Considering the findings of this present study, some suggestions are proposed for both the lecturer and the students. For the lecturers, they are expected to be adaptable to face the learning transition during the pandemic by encouraging the students to have deeper learning and reduce the difficulties faced by the students in English hybrid learning. For the students, they are expected to be capable of maximizing their time in the learning process to have more concentration and awareness on deeper learning and adapting to the learning transition which emphasizes technology. Correspondingly, if this change of learning is not used

properly to maximize the use of technology for the purpose of creating a successful hybrid learning, we would misplace the significant potential to improve education in our country.

REFERENCES

Abidin, Dr. M. J. Z., Pour-Mohammadi, M., & Alzwari, H. (2012). EFL students' Attitudes towards Learning English Language: The Case of Libyan Secondary School Students. *Asian Social Science*, *8*(2), 119–134. https://doi.org/10.5539/ass.v8n2p119

Al Zumor, A. W. Q., Al Refaai, I. K., Bader Eddin, E. A., & Aziz Al-Rahman, F. H. (2013). EFL Students' Perceptions of a Blended Learning Environment: Advantages, Limitations and Suggestions for Improvement. *English Language Teaching*, *6*(10), 95–110. https://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v6n10p95

Alfiras, M., Nagi, M., Bojiah, J., & Sherwani, M. (2021). Students' Perceptions of Hybrid Classes in the Context of Gulf University: An Analytical Study. *Journal of Hunan University Natural Sciences*, *48*(5), 181–188.

Amin, F. M., & Sundari, H. (2020). EFL Students' Preferences on Digital Platforms during Emergency Remote Teaching: Video Conference, LMS, or Messenger Application? *Studies in English Language and Education*, *7*(2), 362–378. https://doi.org/10.24815/siele.v7i2.16929

Baharun, N., & Porter, A. (2009). Teaching Statistics Using a Blended Approach: Integrating Technology-Based Resources. *Proceedings Ascilite Auckland*, 40–48. http://ro.uow.edu.au/cssmwp/44

Bakeer, A. M. (2018). Students' Attitudes towards Implementing Blended Learning in Teaching English in Higher Education Institutions: A Case of Al-Quds Open University. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, *8*(6), 131–139. https://doi.org/10.30845/ijhss.v8n6p15

Christensen, C. M., Horn, M. B., & Staker, H. (2013). Is K-12 Blended Learning Disruptive? In *An Introduction to the Theory of Hybrids* (pp. 1–43). Clayton Christensen Institute.

Fowler, F. J. (2014). *Survey Research Methods* (V. Knight, Ed.; Fifth). SAGE Publications.

Ghofur, M. A. (2017). How to Apply Hybrid Learning for Improving Students Understanding about Regression Model. *Proceedings of the 2nd International Conference on Economic Education and Entrepreneurship*, 452–455.

Ginting, D. (2018). Is a Hybrid Teaching-Learning Model Feasible to Use in Language Classrooms? *Jurnal Bahasa Lingua Scientia*, *10*(1), 183–198. https://doi.org/10.21274/ls.2018.10.1.183-198

Hafiza, Siska, & Putri, D. M. (2022). An Analysis of Students' Attitude in Learning English Through Blended Learning at SMA N Koto Baru. *Jurnal Pendidikan Tambusai*, *6*(1), 1017–1022.

Hawa, S., Suryani, Susiani, R., Dauyah, E., & Majid, A. H. (2021). University Students' Perception toward the Use of the Mother Tongue in the EFL Classroom. *Studies in*

English Language and Education, 8(3), 1094–1110. https://doi.org/10.24815/siele.v8i3.19870

Hediansah, D., & Surjono, H. D. (2020). Hybrid Learning Development to Improve Teacher Learning Management. *JKTP: Jurnal Kajian Teknologi Pendidikan*, 3(1), 1–9. https://doi.org/10.17977/um038v3i12019p001

Holley, D., & Oliver, M. (2010). Student Engagement and Blended Learning: Portraits of Risk. *Computers and Education*, 54(3), 693–700. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2009.08.035

Kaur, M. (2013). Blended Learning - Its Challenges and Future. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 93, 612–617. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2013.09.248

Kazi, A. S., & Moghal, S. (2019). Experiences and Perceptions of Postgraduate Students about a Blended Learning Program in Pakistan. *Global Educational Studies Review*, IV(I), 26–34. https://doi.org/10.31703/gesr.2019(iv-i).04

Kirschner, P., Strijbos, J. W., Kreijns, K., & Beers, P. J. (2004). Designing Electronic Collaborative Learning Environments. In *Educational Technology Research and Development* (Vol. 52, Number 3, pp. 47–66). Springer Boston. https://doi.org/10.1007/BF02504675

Lu, D. (2021). Students' Perceptions of a Blended Learning Environment to Promote Critical Thinking. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 12, 1–9. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2021.696845

Mohamad, M., Hussin, H., & Shaharuddin, S. (2015). Adult Learners' Perceptions of Designed Hypermedia in a Blended Learning Course at a Public University in Malaysia. *TOJET: The Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology*, 14(1), 31–38.

Napier, N. P., Dekhane, S., & Smith, S. (2011). Transitioning to Blended Learning: Understanding Student and Faculty Perceptions. *Journal of Asynchronous Learning Network*, 15(1), 20–32. https://doi.org/10.24059/olj.v15i1.188

Nashir, M., & Laili, R. N. (2021). Hybrid Learning as an Effective Learning Solution on Intensive English Program in the New Normal Era. *Journal of Language Teaching and Learning, Linguistics and Literature*, 9(2), 220–232. https://doi.org/10.24256/ideas.v912.2253

Nouby, A., & Alkhazali, T. (2017). The Effect of Designing a Blended Learning Environment on Achievement and Deep Learning of Graduate Students at the Arabian Gulf University. *Open Journal of Social Sciences*, 05(10), 248–260. https://doi.org/10.4236/jss.2017.510022

Noursi, H. A. O. (2020). The Impact of Blended Learning on the Twelfth Grade Students' English Language Proficiency. *Arab World English Journal*, 11(4), 508–518. https://doi.org/10.24093/awej/vol11no4.32

Permata, I. M., & Nanda, B. J. (2021). Blended Learning: Impact on Student Motivation and Understanding. *Proceedings of the 3rd International Conference on Educational Development and Quality Assurance*, 506, 49–53.

Rerung, M. K. T. (2018). Students' Perception on Blended Learning in English Listening and Speaking Class. *Journal of English Language and Culture*, *9*(1), 17–28. http://journal.ubm.ac.id/

Shams, I. E. (2013). Hybrid Learning and Iranian EFL Learners' Autonomy in Vocabulary Learning. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, *93*, 1587–1592. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2013.10.086

Simbolon, N. E. (2021). EFL Students' Perceptions of Blended Learning in English Language Course: Learning Experience and Engagement. *Journal on English as a Foreign Language*, *11*(1), 152–174. https://doi.org/10.23971/jefl.v11i1.2518

Sriwichai, C. (2020). Students' Readiness and Problems in Learning English through Blended Learning Environment. *Asian Journal of Education and Training*, *6*(1), 23–34. https://doi.org/10.20448/journal.522.2020.61.23.34

Sutisna, E., & Halira Vonti, L. (2020). Innovation Development Strategy for Hybrid Learning Based English Teaching and Learning. *Journal of English Education*, *9*(1), 103–114. https://doi.org/10.25134/erjee.v9i1.3783

Talis, S. S. N., Akib, E., & Baso, F. A. (2018). The Students' Perception toward Implementing Blended Learning Method in English Language Teaching (ELT) at the 5th Semester Students of English Education Department (A Descriptive Qualitative Research). *Jurnal Keguruan Dan Ilmu Pendidikan (JKIP)*, *5*(1), 37–51. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/326732132

Vaksalla, A., Mohd Saat, N. Z., Ishak, I., Hanawi, S. A., Mohd Amin, H., Kamsan, S. S., Zulkifli, N. N., & John, D. N. S. (2019). The Students' Perceptions and Attitudes towards Blended Learning among Undergraduate Students in Kuala Lumpur. *Education in Medicine Journal*, *11*(4), 19–28. https://doi.org/10.21315/eimj2019.11.4.2

Vonti, L. H., & Rahmah, M. (2019). The Use of Hybrid/Blended Learning in Understanding of English Structure Subject to Improve Students' Achievement and Their Digital Literacy. *JHSS (Journal of Humanities and Social Studies)*, *3*(2), 99–102. https://journal.unpak.ac.id/index.php/jhss

Wang, Q. (2009). Guiding Teachers in the Process of ICT Integration (Analysis of Three Conceptual Models). *Educational Technology*, 23–27.

Wichadee, S. (2013). Facilitating Students' Learning with Hybrid Instruction: A Comparison among Four Learning Styles. *Electronic Journal of Research in Educational Psychology*, *11*(1), 99–116.

Yang, X. (2019). Application of Hybrid Teaching Method in English Teaching. *Information and Technology Literacy*, *268*, 353–356.

Yang, Z., Inner, & Spitzer, L. (2020). A Case for Hybrid Learning: Using a Hybrid Model to Teach Advanced Academic Reading. *ORTESOL Journal*, *37*, 11–22