

Comparative Translation Analysis of Subtitle and Dubbing in “Raya and the Last Dragon”

Annisa Aulia

Universitas Dian Nuswantoro, Semarang
nisaaf02@gmail.com

Raden Arief Nugroho

Universitas Dian Nuswantoro, Semarang
arief.nugroho@dsn.dinus.ac.id

Abstract

The objectives of this study are (1) to classify the translation techniques used between subtitles and dubbing (2) to identify the quality of the accuracy instrument between subtitles and dubbing (3) to compare the quality of the accuracy instrument that is more accurate to use. The source data is a movie that is limited to the translated utterances that have different translations in subtitle and dubbing versions. This study used a qualitative method with the following steps; (1) Classifying the translation techniques of subtitle and dubbing data based on Molina and Albir's (2002) classification. (2) Tabulating the comparison of translation techniques between subtitles and dubbing. (3) Identifying the translation quality of accuracy based on the theory of Nababan et al., (4) Drawing conclusions. As a result, both subtitle and dubbing mostly used the established equivalent technique. An established equivalent has a good effect on the quality of accuracy obtained. This technique makes it easier for the audience to understand because it prioritizes the prevalence and naturalness so that the message from SL is conveyed properly. The researcher discovered that dubbing translation is more accurate than subtitle translation. Some subtitle translations are still considered less accurate. The researchers concluded that subtitles are appropriate for adolescents or adults, particularly foreign language learners. Language learners can broaden their knowledge of the language by watching films with subtitles. Meanwhile, dubbing is more appropriate for younger audiences because the language used is typically simpler to comprehend and does not contain swear words or inappropriate words.

Keywords: *accuracy, comparison, dubbing, subtitle, techniques*

1. INTRODUCTION

There are two types of film translations that are often applied, subtitle and dubbing. This is in accordance with Bordwell & Thompson's (1990) statement that "the most two common forms of screen translation are dubbing and subtitling". Both subtitles and dubbing have significant differences (Hastuti et al., 2011). The presence of several constraints in subtitles and dubbing raises particular challenges in both forms of film translation. Therefore, examining the distinctions between these two mediums is interesting since each medium has its obstacles (Jane & Rini, 2022). One of the factors that can be considered is the limitations in subtitle and dubbing. Although both practices represent spoken language, the translation results are different: the subtitle is provided in written form, whereas dubbing is spoken (Hammou, 2020).

Betty White defines subtitles as translations of SL in a TV program or movie into TL. It is also explained that subtitles cannot be more than two lines long. Translation from the source language to the target language cannot be separated from "text", which means that the context of the situation and culture is very important in the translation process (White, 2008). This definition is in line with Gottlieb's statement that a subtitle is described as conveying messages in different languages in movie media and in the form of more than one line of written text, which is displayed on the screen in harmony with the original message (Gottlieb in Munday, 2009). Meanwhile, the dubbing process as described by Cintas (2003) is replacing the original audio voice of the actors' dialogue with the target language voice that represents the original content, while ensuring that the TL voice is in sync with the actor's lip movements. It can be concluded that dubbing is known as the method of audiovisual translation described as the process of converting the source language into the target language through voice recording (Pinero, Rocio & Cintas, 2018).

The Cultural, visual, and aesthetics of the source language may differ from a translation product, which can distract the audience from understanding the translation. Therefore, it is important to know how translators translate subtitles and dubbing from English to Indonesian (Putri, 2018). Subtitles and dubbing present different obstacles for translators due to linguistic characteristics differences (Božović, 2019). According to Schröter (2003), There are various key translation concerns pertinent to both subtitle and dubbing. The selection of words can be complicated, particularly when there is no counterpart in the TL. If the original word is retained, it can confuse the audience.

Subtitles are typically only two lines long and positioned at the bottom of the screen so as not to distract viewers. Moreover, they are also restricted to 35 amount of characters (Abdelaal, 2019). The duration that appears on-screen should correspond to the length of time the actors speak their lines. Another issue to consider is the reading pace of the audience (Puspitasari et al., 2020). The subtitle should not be vanished untimely, as viewers would not have sufficient time to read properly. Dubbing also has similar issues with subtitle. Dubbing presents the fundamental problem in terms of synchronization, which requires ensuring translated dialogue matches the lip and gesture timing of the original visual cast. Phrases are modified so that more compatible with the motions, although this may not necessarily correspond to the original meaning accurately (Chuang, 2006).

Furthermore, Putri (2018) concluded that “translating films such as subtitle and dubbing are distinct from intertextual translation. This is due to technical issues including tone, space, and time. The translators must adhere to the subtitle and dubbing guidelines with accurate translation. This involves deleting, adding, or modifying the text structures in the TL to achieve a high level of translation quality in movie translation.” It can be said that translating subtitle and dubbing has certain challenges. Translators are required to translate accurately and in accordance with the rules contained in the two types of film translation. Translators can apply several techniques to get a good quality of accuracy.

The use of dubbing and subtitle are often provided for the foreign movie in Indonesia. The movie *Raya and the Last Dragon* is one of them. The intended audience for this animated movie is the general public, especially children. Since it is meant for all ages including children, adolescents, and adults, the translation must be simple and easy to comprehend. Thus, it is expected that both the subtitle and dubbing translations have an accurate quality from the selection of the techniques used. According to Molina and Albir (2002), “translation techniques as the procedures for analyzing and classifying how translation equivalency works. They contain five fundamental characteristics: They influence the translation’s outcome, classified by comparison with the original, they influence micro-units of text, they are discursive and contextual by nature, and they are functional”. Furthermore, Molina and Albir (2002) classify translation techniques into 18 techniques, including adaptation, amplification, borrowing, calque, compensation, description, discursive creation, establish equivalent, generalization, linguistic amplification, linguistic compression, literal, modulation, particularization, reduction, substitution, transposition, and variation.

The implementation of translation techniques in a translation affects the quality of the translation results. There are three instruments for measuring the value of translation quality: accuracy, acceptability, and readability. This study focuses on the quality aspect of accuracy. According to Nababan et al., (2012), the term accuracy refers to the equivalence between the source language text and the target language text. The idea of equivalence refers to the resemblance between SL and TL in terms of the contents or messages. It is concluded that the accuracy level of the message conveyed is determined by how accurately the source language’s content or text message is translated into the target language.

This study analyzes the comparison of translation techniques based on Molina and Albir (2002) and translation quality on the accuracy aspect based on Nababan et al., (2012) of subtitles and dubbing in the movie *Raya and The Last Dragon*. The movie was produced by Osnat Shurer and Peter Del Vecho. Directed by Don Hall and Carlos López Estrada, as well as Paul Briggs and John Ripa. This is Walt Disney Animation Studios’ first animated film inspired by the cultural diversity of Southeast Asia, including Indonesia. Mikha Tambayong, Ayu Dewi, and Eva Celia are the Indonesian dubbing voice actors for this animated movie. The film is considered important to analyze because the researchers found that there were distinctions in translation between subtitle and dubbing versions.

Researchers found several previous studies that are relevant to this research. The first study is entitled “Dubbing Translation Technique in the Animated Film of *Frozen: Party is Over*” by Astuti, et al., (2022) The gap between this study and current research is that this research only covers an analysis of translation techniques of dubbing movie, while the

current research in addition to analyzing the dubbing translation version also includes the subtitle version. In analyzing translation techniques in dubbing films, this study found that the translator employed modulation, established equivalent, and literal translation techniques. The literal translation was the most prevalent technique used by the translator with a total of 91.94% of the data. Due to the fact that children are the audience for the movie, the majority of the sentences are simple.

The next previous study was conducted by Sakulpimolrat (2019) entitled “The Analysis of Translation Techniques and Translation Quality of Directives Speech Act in The Little Prince Novel”. The distinguishes between this research and the current research is in the analyzed data. The current research analyzes translation techniques of subtitle and dubbing on a movie and focuses more on assessing the quality of accuracy. Whereas this study focuses on analyzing the translation techniques of directives speech act in a novel and assessing the quality of the translation including aspects of accuracy, acceptability, and readability. The finding shows that 14 techniques are utilized in directive speech act translation. The research concludes that an effective transition is produced through the application of appropriate translation techniques. The translation techniques impact the quality of the translation. An established equivalent result in the translation’s accuracy. Inaccurate translation arises from discursive creation. Moreover, the use of reduction techniques affects the imperfection of translation quality.

Further study was carried out by Jane & Rini, (2022) entitled “Translation Strategies in Indonesian Subtitle and Dubbing of the Greatest Showman”. This study and the current research both compare subtitle and dubbing translation. However, the distinction is the focus of the analysis. The current research analyzes the comparison of translation techniques and the quality of accuracy of the two versions of the film's translation. Meanwhile, this previous study analyzes the comparison of subtitle and dubbing in the movie with the focus of their study to compare translation strategies in subtitle and dubbing based on Baker's (2018) theory. This study identified 12 strategies used and the General Word strategy is often utilized in both Indonesian subtitle and dubbing for circumstances when gender is involved. The researchers found the fact that employing the same strategy does not generate the same translation result indicates that there are limitless interpretations.

Another previous study entitled “Audio-Visual Translation: Subtitling and Dubbing Technique - Movie Soundtrack in Frozen: Let it Go” by Putri & Supardi, (2018). The following previous study only focuses on examining the comparison of subtitles and dubbing of the translation techniques used in the song lyrics of a film’s soundtrack. Meanwhile, the current research completes this gap by examining the comparison of translation techniques as well as the accuracy quality of subtitles and dubbing which the data is a movie. The findings of this previous study show that the translator utilized 11 techniques for subtitle. it appears that the translator employs the majority of the techniques. While in the dubbing version the translator employs only 9 techniques to translate the lyrics. In general, literal translation is the most frequently used technique for the subtitle, whereas modulation and reduction are the most dominant techniques for dubbing.

Both subtitles and dubbing have their own techniques for translating a movie. The translation technique used for each translation type certainly affects the translation quality of

the accuracy output in the target language. The researchers raised the topic of Comparative Translation Analysis of Subtitle and Dubbing in “Raya and The Last Dragon” because it is found that there are differences in translation between subtitle and dubbing versions. Therefore, the researchers wanted to know more about the translation techniques used and the quality of the translation accuracy in subtitles and dubbing by comparing the two types of film translations.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

This research was conducted using several theories, and the data were analyzed based on the theory of translation techniques by Molina and Albir (2002) and the translation quality on the accuracy aspect based on the theory of Nababan et al. (2012).

2.1 Translation Techniques

Molina and Albir (2002) have 18 classifications of translation techniques including; 1) Adaptation is a technique of replacing the SL cultural translation with a TL cultural translation in which the meaning is not the same, but the characteristics of function are still almost the same. Adaptation techniques were performed when there is no suitable equivalence of the translation in ST to TL. 2) Amplification is a technique used to introduce or clarify information or messages from SL by adding detailed, explicitation messages, and paraphrasing the SL structure to make it easier to understand in TL. 3) Borrowing is a technique to maintain the exact translation of SL in TL. This technique consists of pure and naturalized borrowing. 4) Calque is a literal translation of SL phrases or words that is acceptable and common in TL culture. This can be lexical or structural. 5) Compression is a technique that changes the position of the SL structure from or in TL but does not change the meaning. Compression is to make the translation more natural and acceptable in the TL. 6) Description is to describe or explain in detail the meaning of the term SL in TL. 7) Discursive creation is a technique to create temporary equivalence that is unpredictable and out of context. This technique is generally used in translating titles of films, novels, etc. to attract attention. 8) Established equivalence is to translate SL to TL according to its equivalent, also contextual (grammar and lexical). This is a technique whose equivalent is normally used in daily life conversations or used in contextual discourse or dictionaries. 9) Generalization is a technique to find the general equivalence of SL, this technique has done if TL does not have a specific concept similar to SL, but TL has a general concept. 10) Linguistics amplification, add a linguistic element in the translation so that the message from SL becomes clearer. 11) Linguistics compression is the technique of simplifying the SL language elements in TL. 12) Literal translation is a technique of translating word for word that does not change the order, this technique usually results in a translation that is out of context. 13) Modulation, the technique of translating by changing the point of view but the meaning remains the same. 14) Particularization is to find a certain equivalence of SL in TL. This technique is the opposite of generalization. 15) Reduction, is a technique of condensing SL information or messages including deletion and implicitation. 16) Substitution is a technique that changes the linguistic elements of verbal form into nonverbal and vice versa. 17) Transposition is to replace or change the grammatical category (form) of SL in TL. This technique generally occurs because of grammatical differences between SL and TL. 18)

Variation is a translation technique used to change linguistic or paralinguistic elements that affect linguistic variations such as changes in textual tone, language style, social dialect, or the geographical dialect.

2.2 Translation Quality Assessment

Translation quality based on Nababan et al., (2012) divide translation quality into three aspects of assessment. 1) Instrument of accuracy 2) instrument of acceptability, and 3) instrument of readability. In translation quality assessment, each instrument consists of three parts. First, show the category of translation. Second, the score or number on a scale of 1 to 3. Third, the qualitative parameters of each category of translation. This study focuses on the quality instrument of accuracy which is shown in the table below;

Table 1 Translation Accuracy Assessment Instrument

Category Translate	Score	Qualitative Parameters
Accurate	3	There is no meaning distortion when words, technical terms, phrases, clauses, sentences, or texts from the source language are accurately translated into the target language.
Less Accurate	2	Most words, technical terms, phrases, clauses, sentences, or texts in the source language have been translated accurately into the target language. However, the integrity of the message is still compromised by meaning omissions, multiple-meaning translations (taxa), and meaning distortions.
Inaccurate	1	There are inaccurate translations or deletions of words, technical terms, phrases, clauses, sentences, or original language texts.

3. RESEARCH METHODS

This study used a qualitative method. Creswell (2008) defines qualitative as a means of exploring and understanding the meaning that individuals or groups give to social problems. In other words, a qualitative method is an approach to exploring and understanding a central phenomenon. Sihombing (2021) stated that qualitative research focuses on investigating issues such as “what,” “why,” and “how” instead of quantitative inquiries “how many” or “how much.” In this approach, meaning is prioritized over measurement considerations. This statement is in line with the issues that the researcher intended to examine.

The researchers acted as an instrument for this research by applying documentation to record and analyze the dialogue transcripts in the selected subtitle and dubbing versions of the translation. And also use supporting tools such as laptops and stationery. The data of this research are 32 utterances that show the differences in translation between subtitles and dubbing versions in the movie *Raya and The Last Dragon* which is available on the Disney+ Hotstar streaming service. This is an animated film by Disney inspired by Southeast Asian culture that was officially released on March 3, 2021, in Indonesia.

In collecting the data, the researchers do several steps of activities; Searching for a movie on the Disney+ Hotstar streaming service. And watching the selected movie to understand the context of the story and pay attention to the translation of the subtitle and dubbing versions. Then, note-taking and selecting the utterances that have different translations in subtitles and dubbing versions. After the data was collected, the researchers analyzed the data in the following steps; (1) Classifying the translation techniques of subtitle and dubbing data based on Molina and Albir’s (2002) classification. (2) Validating the data. In order to validate the data, the researchers employed the triangulation method, i.e., expert validation and document analysis done by the researcher. (3) Tabulating the comparison of translation techniques between subtitles and dubbing. (4) Identifying the translation quality of the accuracy aspect based on the theory of Nababan et al., (2012). (5) Drawing conclusions.

4. RESULTS

The data results of subtitles and dubbing for the film *Raya and The Last Dragon* based on the technique of Molina and Albir (2002) are shown in the table below.

Table 2 Translation Technique Classifications

No.	Molina & Albir Classification	Subtitle		Dubbing	
		Data	%	Data	%
1.	Amplification	3	9.37%	3	9.37%
2.	Borrowing	2	6.25%	3	9.37%
3.	Description	0	-	3	9.37%
4.	Discursive Creation	4	12.5%	7	21.87%
5.	Established Equivalent	6	18.75%	9	28.12%
6.	Generalization	2	6.25%	0	-
7.	Linguistic Amplification	3	9.37%	2	6.25%
8.	Linguistic Compression	0	-	2	6.25%
9.	Literal Translation	4	12.5%	2	6.25%
10.	Modulation	3	9.37%	0	-
11.	Reduction	2	6.25%	0	-
12.	Transposition	2	6.25%	0	-
13.	Variation	1	3.12%	1	3.12%

Based on the analysis data, there are 11 techniques used in translating subtitle data using the techniques of Amplification, Borrowing, Discursive Creation, Established Equivalent, Generalization, Linguistic Amplification, Literal Translation, Modulation, Reduction, Transposition, and Variation. Subtitle data mostly used the established equivalent technique (18.75%). In the dubbing data, there are 9 techniques used there are Amplification, Borrowing, Description, Discursive Creation, Established Equivalent, Linguistic Amplification, Linguistic Compression, Transposition, and variation. The same as the subtitle, the most widely used technique is established equivalent (28.12%).

Table 3 Accuracy Assessment of Subtitle and Dubbing Translation

Types of translation movie	Data	Accuracy Score		
		3	2	1
Subtitle	32	65.62%	31.25%	3.12%
Dubbing		81.25%	15.62%	3.12%

Based on the analysis of the translation quality data in the table above, dubbing has a high accurate score of as much as 26 data (81.25%), less accurate 5 data (15.62%), and inaccurate as much as 1 data (3.12%). While the accuracy of subtitles is also high, although the value is not as high as dubbing, the accurate score is as much as 21 data (65.62%). Less accurate is 10 data (31.25%), and inaccurate is 1 data (3.12%).

4.1 Translation Techniques

There are 13 translation techniques in this study with examples of analysis as follows:

Amplification

Data S.20

SL: Does this *thing* go any faster?

TL: *Perahu* ini bisa lebih cepat?

Data D.17

SL: 'Cause Ongis have *nine stomachs*.

TL: Karena Ongis punya *nafsu makan besar*.

In the subtitle data, 'thing' is made explicit or clarified its meaning becomes 'boats'. This is because in the context of the scene Raya and Sisu are on Captain Boun's boat. So that this technique is applied to clarify the meaning of SL. In the dubbing data, the context of the scene shows Ongis as a fictional animal character who has a big appetite. "Nine stomachs" translates to "nafsu makan besar", this shows that the translator makes explicit the meaning to clarify the message of SL to TL.

Borrowing

Data S.11

SL: Uh. Careful. It's a *Toot N boom*.

TL: Hati-hati. Itu *Toot N boom*.

Data D.15

SL: Do you mean *Captain Pop and Lock* over there?

TL: Maksudmu *kapten Pop dan Lock* disana?

The subtitle data shows the type of pure borrowing because the form of 'Toot N Boom' is not changed in TL. In this context 'Toot N Boom' is a fictional insect that only exists in the movie, so that this technique is applied to avoid audiences' confusion. While the dubbing data shows that TL retains the form of SL, and this includes both pure and naturalized borrowing types.

Description

Data D.01

SL: *A dystopian world.*

TL: *Dunia yang penuh ketakutan.*

In the dubbing data, according to the concept and its name, the translator tries to describe the meaning of ‘dystopian world’ which in TL means a world full of fear.

Discursive creation

Data S.27

SL: Uh, no. Yeah, *that's not flow. That's a clog.*

TL: *Itu bukan rencana bagus. Itu buruk.*

Data D.16

SL: Hot, hotter, or *Boun-goes-the-dynamite?*

TL: *Pedas, lebih pedas, atau Boun! Pedas meledak.*

The two data show equivalency while the translation items are very much different from the SL, the translator uses this technique to attract the attention of the audience and readers but the creation of equivalence is adjusted to the context of the scenes.

Established Equivalent

Data S.21

SL: Wow! What a smart way to *Druun-proof* your house.

TL: Cara yang cerdas agar rumahmu *anti Druun*.

Data D.07

SL: They're *repelled* by water.

TL: Mereka *takut* akan air.

In the subtitle, the translator translates ‘Druun-proof’ into ‘anti-Druun’ because the translation is well established and contextual so that the translator maintains the style and meaning of SL in TL. This translation is the same as the word ‘waterproof’ which is translated into ‘anti-air’. In the dubbing data, the context of the scene shows there are plagues named Druun that are afraid of water and they are avoiding the water around them. The translator interprets ‘repelled’ as ‘fear’ because of seeing the context of the scene and the translation is commonly used.

Generalization

Data S.15

SL: Do you mean Captain *Pop and Lock* over there?

TL: Maksudmu, kapten *dansa* itu?

Data S.31

SL: Are you sure those four *miniature menaces* will be successful?

TL: Kau yakin empat *mahluk mini* itu akan berhasil?

‘Pop and Lock’ relates to the type of breakdance style because there is no specific equivalent for these words, the translator translates the equivalent that is common in TL to ‘kapten dansa’. Meanwhile, in data S.31, *Menace* (noun) means an extremely annoying person. someone that may cause threat or causes trouble and annoyance. Because the word is

intended for humans, the translator tries to find a common equivalent in the TL which is close to the meaning of the word. Thus, it translates to ‘creature’.

Linguistics Amplification

Data S.29

SL: Of course, he *will*.

TL: Tentu dia akan *mengenalimu*.

Data D.19

SL: What are you, *12?*

TL: Apa kau *berumur 12 tahun?*

In the subtitle data, there is the addition of a linguistic element in the form of the word ‘*mengenalimu*’. While the dubbing data contains the addition of linguistic elements ‘*berumur*’ and ‘*tahun*’. Both data show that there is an additional linguistic element that aims to clarify the message so that it is easier to understand.

Linguistics Compression

Data D.25

SL: Burn them *out*.

TL: Bakar mereka.

The SL sentence means “Bakar mereka keluar” but in TL it is only translated to “bakar mereka” although there is a simplification of linguistic elements, the translation does not reduce its meaning viewed from the context of the scene.

Literal Translation

Data S.07

SL: They’re repelled by water.

TL: Mereka ditolak oleh air.

The data translate sentences with their structural functions unchanged. If separated word for word become, *They’re=mereka*, *repelled=ditolak*, *by=oleh*, *water=air* this indicates that this data appropriates the description of literal translation technique, which is translating word for word.

Modulation

Data S.24

SL: The moniker given to me is Tong.

TL: Aku diberi nama Tong.

The data show a change in the point of view of the SL structure in the TL. There is a semantic shift but the meaning does not change. If translated literally according to the SL structure it would be “*Nama yang diberikan padaku adalah Tong*” but the translator changed the structure to “*Aku diberi nama Tong*”. Generally, the translator uses this technique to make the translation more natural.

Reduction

Data S.08

SL: Wanna finish this, *Skippy*?

TL: Mau habiskan ini?

The data shows that there is a reduction in some elements of the SL, ‘Skippy’ is not translated into TL. Reductions sometimes make the message of SL less clear in the TL.

Transposition

Data S.28

SL: Their blades are specially designed for the *stabbing of backs*.

TL: Pedang mereka dirancang khusus untuk *menikam dari belakang*.

The data shows ‘backs’ in SL means ‘punggung’, this is a noun form. However, in the subtitles, it is translated into ‘back’ means ‘belakang’ which is an adjective form. This indicates a change in word-class shift.

Variation

Data S.30

SL: *Good-looking* with impeccable hair?

TL: *Cakap* dengan rambut yang sempurna?

Data D.14

SL: *Bye-bye*, binturi.

TL: *Dadah*, binturi.

Bye-bye is generally translated as ‘sampai jumpa’ or ‘selamat tinggal’, but translators translate it into ‘Dadah’ which is an absorption word and an informal form of parting expressions in Indonesian. Likewise in the subtitle data, ‘good-looking’ is translated into ‘cakap’. ‘Cakap’ or *cakep* itself in Indonesian is a slang that means charming. This shows that there is a change in linguistic elements that affect linguistic variations or language styles.

4.2 Translation Quality

Accurate

Translation can be said to be accurate if there is no meaning distortion when words, technical terms, phrases, clauses, sentences, or texts from the source language are accurately translated into the target language.

Data S.14

SL: Bye-bye, binturi. -- TL: Sampai jumpa, binturi.

Data D.01

SL: A dystopian world. -- TL: dunia yang penuh ketakutan.

The translation of the data S.14 is correct and accurately translated into Indonesian and there is no distortion of meaning. In data D.01, the translation is also considered accurate because there is no distortion of meaning. The translation also uses a description technique by translating the term *dystopian* by explaining its meaning so that the translation is easier to understand and increases the knowledge of the audience. So both examples of data get an accuracy score of 3.

Less Accurate

The translation is considered less accurate if most of the words, technical terms, phrases, clauses, sentences, or texts in the source language have been accurately translated into the target language but there are few problems with the integrity of the message such as omissions, double meaning translations (taxa), and distortion of meaning.

Data S.07

SL: They're repelled by water. -- TL: mereka ditolak oleh air.

Data D.32

SL: It's written on her collar. -- TL: Itu tertulis di kalungnya.

In the example of Data S.07 above, it is considered less accurate because even though some of the meanings have been transferred accurately, the word *repelled* translated to *ditolak* which is deemed to be less appropriate with the context of the scene, thus it can reduce the integrity of the message and the understanding of the audience. In Data D.32, some meanings have been transferred correctly, but the word *collar* in the context of the movie is indicated for the collar of a shirt, while in the dubbing version it is translated into a necklace so the following data is considered less accurate due to distortion of meaning. This causes the translation of the word to be less in accordance with the context and disrupts the integrity of the message.

Inaccurate

The translation is categorized as not accurate when there is an inaccurate translation or deletion of words, technical terms, phrases, clauses, sentences, or original language texts.

Data S.10

SL: I'm wicked when I hit that liquid. I got water skills that kill. I slaughter when I hit the water.

TL: Aku mengesankan di cairan. Keterampilan airku memukau. Aku mahir di dalam air.

Data D.13

SL: Clasp onto your congee. Today's special is... to go.

TL: Bersiaplah kita akan segera, berangkat.

In the example of Data S.10, the translation is transferred by explaining the meaning of the SL. However, in the context of this example, it is a rhyme, so if it is translated as above it is not in accordance with the rules of writing rhymes as in SL. This results in the deletion of phrases and deviations that interfere with the delivery of a rhyme. Thus, the two examples above are categorized as not accurate. Meanwhile, in Data D.13, although the translation is adjusted to the intonation of the characters in the movie, the transfer form of the translation to the target language is much different from the source language so there is a distortion of meaning and deletion phrase from the SL.

5. DISCUSSION

From the findings presented, both subtitles and dubbing mostly apply the Established Equivalent translation technique. In subtitles, the Established Equivalent technique is used as much as 18.75% and in dubbing as much as 28.12%. The use of this technique is dominantly used in dubbing. Another phenomenon related to the translation technique in this research is the use of the discursive creation technique as the second most utilized technique. However,

this technique is most commonly employed in dubbing. Meanwhile, in terms of the quality of accuracy of film translation, dubbing has a higher level of accuracy than the accuracy of subtitles. The accuracy of dubbing is 81.25%, while the subtitle is 65.62%.

The established Equivalent technique is to utilize a term or expression that is commonly used or recognized by dictionaries as having an equivalent in the Target Language (Molina & Albir, 2002). Research conducted by Hadi et al., (2015) on the translation technique used in the subtitle of the movie *The Angry Birds*, found in their study that the dominant technique was Established Equivalent. They stated that the grammar of the SL and TL would be modified using this technique in the form of phrases, clauses, and sentences. Utami & Satyaningrum (2022) in their study of translation techniques in subtitle found that the established equivalent is the translation technique with the most frequency level or often appears in translating the Indonesian subtitles of the *Our Planet* documentary series. Because it employs common terms or expressions in the TL, the established equivalent translation technique is often employed.

It is also in harmony with the research findings of Restiana & Nugroho (2021) that Establish Equivalence as the technique with the highest frequency. Intriguingly, it may be observed that translators are particularly concerned about the original language's grammatical structures. Since the grammatical structure of the source language is distinct from the target language, translators choose to employ a more common dictionary-based language that is equal to the target language. The study about the influence of translation techniques on the translation quality of the accuracy and acceptability conducted by Aresta et al., (2018) indicates that Established Equivalent is the most common technique that can transmit a relevant meaning in the target text and achieves a high level of translation accuracy and acceptability. Sakulpimolrat (2019) regarding the analysis of translation techniques and the translation quality of directives speech acts in the novel "The Little Prince". The researchers stated that Established Equivalence was the most employed translation technique that resulted in an accurate, acceptable, and readable outcome. She also argues that numerous translation techniques contribute to translation accuracy. However, established equivalence is the most dominating technique since the meaning from the source language may transfer effectively into the target language (Larassati et al., 2019).

However, some other previous studies discover that the Established Equivalent technique appears the least. In the study of Hadi et al., (2020) regarding the ideology and translation techniques used in the Indonesian version of the novel, Established Equivalent occurs only 1% of the frequency. This is supported by the finding about translation techniques, which indicate that source language-oriented translation techniques are the most prevalent literal translation technique, with a frequency of over fifty percent. Meanwhile, a similar study related to translation techniques in the novel "A Time to Kill" carried out by Ndruru (2017) found that an Established Equivalent occurs only 6 times. The translation technique chosen and used does not only prioritize the source language but also the target language to achieve a balance between the accuracy of the message conveyed by the author to TL and TL audiences. The translation aims to convey the same emotions and perceptions from the source language to the target language. Thus, translators are advised to employ proper techniques while translating translation products.

Referring to the finding of this study and the assumptions of the previous researchers, Established Equivalent is a technique that has a good effect on the quality of accuracy obtained. However, in some translation products, the Established Equivalent technique is not always used frequently. Translators must consider the context and employ the appropriate techniques. As in literary works, poems, and poetry translation. An established Equivalent cannot always be applied to these works, because it will impact the quality of the translation. The researchers assume that the Established Equivalent technique makes it easier for the audience to understand because this technique translates by prioritizing the prevalence and naturalness so that the message from SL is conveyed properly (Nugroho et al., 2016). Established Equivalent is a technique that is also widely used in various translations such as films, novels, textbooks, or also in the guidebook.

Another phenomenon in the current research is the implementation of the Discursive Creation technique in dubbing translation. Molina & Albir (2002) defines Discursive Creation is to create a temporary equivalency that is completely unpredictable outside of its context. This is a cognitive process in the translation that establish a non-lexical equivalency that is context-dependent (Delisle, 1993 in Molina & Albir, 2002). This translation technique approach is commonly employed in translating titles for films, novels, and so on. The objective is to draw attention. Matahari & Meilasari's (2022) study on the translation techniques of frightening expressions in two short stories by Edgar Allan Poe discovered the differences in translating the two stories in frightening expressions. Established equivalence being the widely used translation technique in *The Black Cat*, indicate that the translation tends to handle the meaning naturally. In contrast, discursive creation is the most dominant technique in *The Fall of the House of Usher*, which indicates that the translation emphasizes naturalness and harmony rather the meaning.

Another previous study that discussed discursive creation was carried out by Istiqomah et al., (2019) in their research on the discursive creation technique of subtitles in Harry Potter: The Chamber of Secrets movie. Their research discovered that 57% of the 49 data on discursive creation dominated the sentence language category. According to their findings, the discursive creation technique was categorized into three types of language units: word, phrase, and sentence. The researchers found 28 data that employed the discursive creation technique and had a distinct sentence meaning. As a result, the subtitles were translated differently than the source text in order to allow audiences to comprehend the film due to cultural differences. The translator modifies the subtitle with simple words depending on their thoughts and sometimes untranslated the subtitle since there is no adequate equivalent in Indonesian (Suryaningtyas et al., 2019).

The study by Nugroho, Muljono, & Nababan, (2021) regarding translation techniques performed by blind translators identified that visually impaired translators utilize literal translation and discursive creation techniques. The employment of literal translation produces rigid translation, whereas the use of discursive creation resulted in a shift in meaning between the source language and the target language. The researchers state that in translating popular scientific texts, translators should lessen the use of literal and discursive creation translation techniques to enhance their translation skills. Rahmaningsih & Hutahaean (2021) in their study discovered that Discursive Creation is the least employed

technique in translating Ahmad Fuadi's novel *Negeri 5 Menara*. Because the translator cannot find an equivalence from Indonesian to English that is completely unforeseeable out of context. Aresta et al., (2018) in their study of investigating translation techniques that affect the quality of translation argue that low translation accuracy scores are caused by the use of translation techniques such as reduction, addition, and discursive creation. The employment of specific translation techniques was discovered to have a bad effect. A translation mismatch is caused by Discursive Creation. It creates a transient equivalency that is completely unpredictable outside of context. Because the target text delivers a different message, translations using this technique are assessed to be inaccurate.

Based on the findings of this research and the previous studies, the researchers conclude that translations employing the discursive creation technique are generally not semantically equal or cannot be predicted. Even if the translation was unpredictable, the form of the translation is still adapted to the context so that it does not change arbitrarily to another perspective (Basari & Nugroho, 2017). Thus, the translation results make sense and are relevant to the message of the source language. In this research, the discursive creation technique is widely utilized in dubbing because it is in line with the dubbing audience which is generally children. Some words are frequently changed in dubbing translations to prevent the use of swear words or bad words. However, in terms of the quality of translation accuracy, this technique is frequently considered to be less accurate because the translation form differs from its equivalency meaning. However, it is still acceptable in terms of the message conveyed because it considers the context and the target audience (Pratama et al., 2021).

Several factors must be considered in applying film translations such as subtitle and dubbing. Some studies have different opinions regarding the use of the type of translation film (subtitle and dubbing). Since it is hard to determine whether subtitles or dubbing is preferable, two factors seem to determine whether a particular program will be subtitle or dubbing: economic considerations and audience expectations and preferences (Putri, 2018). Meanwhile, Perego, Del Missier, & Stragà, (2018) stated that cultural, socioeconomic, political, and geographical aspects influence the application of these techniques.

In fact, English is the world's most learned foreign language. Thus, learning English will be very beneficial for young learners. Films contributed to the advancement of education and learning translation through subtitles (Ashlikhatina & Mujiyanto, 2021). In line with this statement, Ebrahim (2016) argue that students who are studying English or another language are strongly encouraged to watch films with subtitle, specifically for the enhancement of reading and listening comprehension, word understanding, decoding abilities, motivation, and vocabulary acquisition. Hastuti et al., (2011) on the other hand, identified certain issues that translators may encounter while translating subtitles. In terms of language and culture arise from cultural references, idioms, puns, humor satire, and pragmatic meanings. In terms of media, there are two factors that make subtitling difficult: time and place constraints (layout). Furthermore, the translator also faces the challenge of determining the timing of the subtitle's appearance. Pahamzah & Syariifah (2019) concluded that the translator would choose the simplest translation to apply to the film's subtitle so that it is easier for the audience to grasp the information and it does not disturb the visual of the film being displayed.

Meanwhile, according to Astuti et al., (2022), dubbing allows the audience to relish the plot of a film without being distracted by the subtitles on the screen. However, the actors' and actresses' original voices cannot be heard by the audience. In addition, the dubbing process is more highly priced due to the large number of casts required to substitute the character voices. Furthermore, there are several steps involved which make the production process quite long. Setiawan (2018) argues that, from a particular perspective, dubbing is deemed more appropriate for audiences with low levels of reading ability (e.g., children). Consequently, the majority of films that employ the dubbing method are children's films, animations, and cartoons.

A number of perspectives on subtitle and dubbing have been compared. These types have their respective criticism; dubbing is said to lessen the atmosphere of a film and allow for censorship, while those who disagree with subtitle emphasize that it disturbs the screen and diverts the audience's attention (Şahin, 2012). In light of this research and the viewpoints of previous researchers, the researchers concluded that subtitle is appropriate for adolescents or adults, particularly foreign language learners. Through film subtitle, foreign language learners can expand their knowledge of the language. This can be accomplished by learning new vocabulary, or the use of phrases and idioms. Meanwhile, the use of dubbing is more appropriate for younger audiences, such as children and early adolescents, because the language used is typically simpler to comprehend and does not contain inappropriate words (Shalekhah et al., 2020). In general, curse words and other rude expressions are avoided in dubbing translations.

6. CONCLUSION

Based on the analysis data, there are 11 techniques used in translating subtitle using the techniques of Amplification, Borrowing, Discursive Creation, Established Equivalent, Generalization, Linguistic Amplification, Literal Translation, Modulation, Reduction, Transposition, and Variation. Most of the subtitle data used the established equivalent technique (18.75%). Meanwhile, in the dubbing data, there are 9 techniques used, Amplification, Borrowing, Description, Discursive Creation, Established Equivalent, Linguistic Amplification, Linguistic Compression, Transposition, and variation. The same as the subtitle, the most dominant technique used is established equivalent (28.12%).

For the assessment of the translation quality of accuracy from 32 total data, dubbing has a high accuracy score of 26 data (81.25%), less accurate as much as 5 data (15.62%), and inaccurate as much as 1 data (3.12%). While the subtitle accuracy scale is also high but not as high as dubbing, out of 32 total data there are 21 data (65.62%), less accurate as much as 10 data (31.25%), and inaccurate as much as 1 data (3.12%). From these results, it can be concluded that dubbing translation is more accurate, indicated by a high accuracy score, while the subtitle translation is also considered accurate, however, there are still some translations that are considered less accurate.

Established Equivalent is a technique that has a good effect on the quality of accuracy obtained. The researchers assume that the Established Equivalent technique makes it easier for the audience to understand because this technique translates by prioritizing the prevalence and naturalness so that the message from SL is conveyed properly. The

discursive creation technique is the second most utilized technique in dubbing because it is in line with the dubbing audience which is generally children. Some words are frequently changed in dubbing translations to prevent the use of swear words or bad words. However, in terms of the quality of translation accuracy, this technique is frequently considered to be less accurate because the translation form differs from its equivalency meaning. However, it is still acceptable in terms of the message conveyed because it considers the context and the target audience. The researchers concluded that subtitle is appropriate for adolescents or adults, particularly foreign language learners especially English learners. Through film subtitle, foreign language learners can expand their knowledge of the language. Meanwhile, dubbing is more appropriate for younger audiences, such as children and early adolescents, because the language used is typically simpler to comprehend and does not contain inappropriate words. In general, curse words and other rude expressions are avoided in dubbing translations.

REFERENCES

- Abdelaal, N. M. (2019). Subtitling of Culture-Bound Terms: Strategies and Quality Assessment. *Heliyon*, 5(4), 1-27. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2019.e01411>
- Aresta, R., Nababan, M. R., & Djatmika (2018) The Influence of Translation Techniques on the Accuracy and Acceptability of Translated Utterances that Flout the Maxim of Quality. *Humaniora*, Vol. 30, No.2, June 2018, 176–191. DOI: doi.org/10.22216/jh.v29i3.33645
- Ashlikhatina, A. & Mujiyanto, J. (2021). The Accuracy of Sentence Level in English Indonesian Subtitle of ‘The End of the F***Ing World – Season 2’. *JELLT (Journal of English Language and Literature Teaching)* Vol. 06 No. 02 November 2021.
- Astuti, P.I., Widarwati, N.T., Wijayava, R., & Muamaroh, M. (2022). Dubbing Translation Technique in the Animation Film of Frozen: Party is over. *Script Journal: Journal of Linguistics and English Teaching*, 7(1), 130-139. <https://doi.org/10.24903/sj.v7i1.1075>
- Basari, A. & Nugroho, R.A. (2017). The Use of *Aegisub* in Teaching Audiovisual Translation Classes: A Review On IT-Based Subtitling Course. *The 1st Education and Language International Conference Proceedings Center for International Language Development of Unissula*.
- Bordwell, David, and Kristin Thompson. 1990. *Film Art (An Introduction)* Third Edition. United States of America: McGraw-Hill, Inc.
- Božović, P. (2019). How Should Culture be Rendered in Subtitling and Dubbing? *Babel, International Journal of Translation*, 65(1), 81-95. <https://doi.org/10.1075/babel.00082.boz>
- Chuang, Y. (2006). Studying Subtitle Translation from a Multi-Modal Approach. *Babel, Revue Internationale de La Traduction/International Journal of Translation*, 4, No. 52: 372–83
- Cintas, D. J. (2003). Audiovisual translation in the third millennium. In G. Anderman & M. Rogers (Eds.), *Translation Today: Trends and perspectives* (pp. 192-204). Clevedon, UK: Multilingual Matters.

- Creswell, John W. 2008. *Educational Research, Planning, Conducting, And Evaluating Qualitative Dan Quantitative Approaches*. London: Sage Publications.
- Gambier, Y. (1993). "Audiovisual communication: typological detour". Teaching Translation and Interpreting 2. Philadelphia: John Benjamin.
- Hadi M. Z. P., Suhendra E. & Miswaty T. C. (2020) Translation Ideology and Techniques Used in Indonesian Version of Agatha Christie's Endless Night Novel. *Humanitatis, Journal on Language and Literature*, Vol. 6 No. 2 June 2020.
- Hadi, Z., Waluyo, U., & Baharuddin. (2021). An analysis of translation techniques used by subtitle writer of The Angry Birds Movie. *JEEF (Journal of English Education Forum)*, 1(1), 1-9.
- Hammou, S. B. (2020). Shift of Oral and Written Language Features in Audio-Visual Translation: A Case Study of Subtitling and Dubbing of The American Tv Show "Prison Break". *International Journal of English Language Studies (IJELS)*, 2(2), 30-45.
- Hastuti, E. D., Nunun T. W., Giyatmi, & Ratih W., (2011). Analisis Terjemahan Film Inggris - Indonesia: Studi Kasus Terjemahan Film "Romeo and Juliet" (Kajian Tentang Strategi Penerjemahan), Seminar Hasil Penelitian dan Pengabdian kepada Masyarakat, LPPM Univet Bantara Sukoharjo.
- Istiqomah, L., Erawati, M., Suparno, S., L. (2019) Discursive Creation Technique of English to Indonesian Subtitle in Harry Potter: The Chamber of Secrets Movie. *Lingual*. Vol. 7, No.1, 2019.
- Jane, Y., & Rini, J. E. (2022). Translation Strategies in Indonesian Subtitle and Dubbing of The Greatest Showman. *Kata Kita*, Vol. 10, No. 1, March 2022, 1-9. DOI: 10.9744/katakita.10.1.1-9
- Larassati, A., Setyaningsih, N., Nugroho, R.A., Suryaningtyas, V.W., Cahyono, S.P. & Pamelasari, S.D. (2019) Google vs. Instagram Machine Translation: Multilingual Application Program Interface Errors in Translating Procedure Text Genre. *Proceedings - 2019 International Seminar on Application for Technology of Information and Communication: Industry 4.0: Retrospect, Prospect, and Challenges, iSemantic 2019*. DOI: 10.1109/ISEMANTIC.2019.8884334
- Matahari, F., & Meilasai, P. (2022) The translation of frightening expressions in Edgar Allan Poe's short stories. *Humaniora Scientia: Online Journal on Linguistics, Literature, and Translation*. Vol. 08, No. 1, Maret 2022
- Molina, L., and A.H. Albir. "Molina, L., & Albir, A. H. (2002). Translation Techniques Revisited: A Dynamic and Functionalist Approach. *Meta: Translators' Journal*, XLVII (4)." XLVII, no. 4 (2002).
- Munday, J. (2009). *The Routledge Companion to Translation Studies*: revised edition e-book. USA: Routledge.
- Nababan, M. N., Nuraeni, A., & Sumardiono. (2012). Pengembangan Model Penilaian Kualitas Terjemahan. *Kajian Linguistik dan Sastra*, 24(1).
- Ndruru. E. (2017) Translation Techniques Used in Translating John Grisham's "A Time to Kill" Novel into Indonesian. *RETORIKA: Jurnal Ilmu Bahasa*, 3(2). 201-210. DOI: 10.22225/jr.3.2.311.201-210

- Nugroho, R. A., Muljono, & Nababan, M. R. (2021). Visually Impaired Novice Translators in Using Translation Techniques. *Script Journal: Journal of Linguistics and English Teaching*, 6(2).
- Nugroho, R. A., Nababan, M. R., & Subroto, E. D. (2016). Translation Microstrategies Used by Visually Impaired Translators. *International Journal of Linguistics*, 6(5).
- Pahamzah, J. & Syariifah, A. (2019). "Translation Techniques of Subtitling: A Case for Trolls Movie" *JELTS Vol. 2 No. 2*, 2019.
- Perego, E., Del Missier, F., & Stragà, M. (2018). Dubbing vs. Subtitling. *Target: International Journal of Translation Studies*, 30(1), 137-157. <https://doi.org/10.1075/target.16083.per>.
- Pinero, R., Cintas, J. D. (2018) *Language and Translation in Film: Dubbing and Subtitling*. London: Routledge.
- Pratama, A.A., Ramadhan, T.B.L, Elawati, F.N., & Nugroho, R.A. 2021. Translation Quality Analysis of Cultural Words in Translated Tourism Promotional Text of Central Java. *JELTL (Journal of English Language Teaching and Linguistics)*, Vol. 6(1), 2021.
- Puspitasari, M. S., Tabiati, S. E., & Junining, E. (2020). Translation in movie subtitles: Foreignization and domestication. *Lensa: Kajian Kebahasaan, Kesusastraan, dan Budaya*, 10(1), 1-15. <https://doi.org/10.26714/lensa.10.1.2020.1-15>
- Putri, D. A., & Supardi, M. (2018). "Audio-Visual Translation: Subtitling and Dubbing Technique - Movie Soundtrack in Frozen: Let it Go". *Buletin Al-Turas Vol. XXIV No.2*, Juli 2018.
- Rahmaningsih, N. & Hutahaean, S. (2021) The Analysis of Translation Techniques in Translating Ahmad Fuadi's Negeri 5 Menara into Angie Kilbane's The Land of 5 Towers. *Jurnal Ilmu Budaya*. Vol. 18, No.1, Augustus 2021
- Restiana, I. O. & Nugroho, R. A. (2021) Translation Techniques of Medical Terms Found in Covid-19 Guidebook. *JELTL (Journal of English Language Teaching and Linguistics)*, 6(3), 2021 DOI: <https://dx.doi.org/10.21462/jeltl.v6i3.663>
- Şahin, Ayhan (2012) *Dubbing as a Type of Audiovisual Translation: A Study of its Methods and Constraints Focusing on Shrek 2*. Master thesis. Atilim University.
- Sakulpimolrat, S. (2019) The Analysis of Translation Techniques and Translation Quality of Directives Speech Act in The Little Prince Novel. *Prasasti. Journal of Linguistics*, Vol. 4, Number 2 November 2019.
- Schroter, T. (2003). Quantity and Quality in Screen Translation. *Perspectives: Studies in Translatology*, 11(2), 105-124." 2, no. 11 (2003): 105–24
- Setiawan, K. (2018). Strategi Penerjemahan dan Kesepadanan Makna pada Terjemahan Subtitle Film "Turah". *Mengangkat Bahasa Jawa Ngapak ke Kancah Internasional. Prosiding*, 8(1).
- Shalekhah, R.A., Estayani, S.A., Sari, M., Nugroho, R.A. (2020). Linguistic Politeness Analysis of Indonesia's Prominent YouTube Influencers. *JELTL (Journal of English Language Teaching and Linguistics)*, Vol. 5(3), 2020.
- Sihombing, P. S. R., Silalahi, D. E., Saragih, D. I., Herman, H. (2021). An Analysis of Illocutionary Act in Incredible 2 Movie. *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute (BIRCI-Journal): Humanities and Social Sciences*, 4 (2), 1772–1783. doi: <http://doi.org/10.33258/birci.v4i2.1850>

- Suryaningtyas, V. W., Nugroho, R. A., Cahyono, S. P., Nababan, M. R., & Santosa, R. (2019). Translation Learning Enrichment Using Smart Application Creator 3.0: An Attempt to Design a Mobile Application in Translation for Tourism Purpose Course. *Proceedings - 2019 International Seminar on Application for Technology of Information and Communication: Industry 4.0: Retrospect, Prospect, and Challenges, iSemantic 2019*, 542–547.
- Utami, M. T. & Satyaningrum, N. (2022) Translation Techniques of Indonesian Subtitle in Our Planet Documentary Series. *Wanastra : Jurnal Bahasa dan Sastra*, Volume 14 No. 2, September 2022, DOI: <https://doi.org/10.31294/w.v12i1>
- White, B. (2008). “Subtitling: The Museum of Broadcast Communication”. *Translation Journal*, URL: <http://accurapid.com/journal/32film.html>.
- Wicaksono, R. D. & Kuswardani, Y. (2019) Translation Analysis of Subtitle from English Into Indonesian in The Raid 2 Movie. *English Teaching Journal: A Journal of English Literature, Linguistics, and Education*. Vol.7, No.2, December 2019, pp. 79~85 DOI: 10.11591/etj.v7i2.5439